



# *Torne Valley Preservation Association*

P.O. Box 765, Hillburn, NY 10931-0765

845-357-9249 email: [savetorne@aol.com](mailto:savetorne@aol.com)

Jeremy Rosenthal  
New York State Department of Environmental Conservation  
Division of Environmental Permits  
625 Broadway 4<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Albany, New York 122233-1750

## **Board of Directors**

Patsy Wooters, *Chair*  
Robert J. Drennen, *Co-Chair*  
Theodore Arin, *Secretary*  
Robert Neff, *Treasurer*  
Deborah Kurtzman  
Ron Javer  
Raymond Kane  
Laura Plessner  
Lee Sneden  
Margaret Wissler

Dear Mr. Rosenthal,

I request that the scope of the environmental review for the proposed United Water desalination plant for Rockland County include a cost/benefit analysis of

- water lost in the United Water delivery system that could be conserved and supplied to customers,

What is the actual volume of water leaked from the United Water delivery system? What would the economic benefit be to water ratepayers of conserving this water versus replacing it with water produced in a desalination plant? To what degree would this mitigate the need for an additional peak supply of water?

- use of gray water from Rockland County Waster Water Treatment Plants,

What is the feasibility of distributing treated water from Rockland County waste water treatment plants including the advanced waste water treatment plant in Hillburn for industrial use? For private irrigation? Through pipes? By tanker? What about dual gray water/drinking water piping for large consumers of water? To what degree would these mitigate the need for an additional peak supply of water?

- use of routine domestic irrigation restrictions by the Rockland Health Department as used in regions with scarce water,

What are customary restrictions in communities with access to scarce water? Could such restrictions on domestic and commercial irrigation mitigate the need to peak water sufficiently to address Rockland's shortage without resorting to desalination? What about banning in ground irrigation systems except for nurseries? What about alternate day watering for private homes for the entire growing season? What about promoting landscaping with native plants that do not require watering? To what degree would these mitigate the need for an additional peak supply of water?

- impacts on air quality from increased energy use including electricity and power used to generate that electricity,

What would the cumulative impact be on local climate change with the addition of local energy use from desalination? What would the impacts be on air quality in a region that is already non-compliant with federal

standards of clean air? What is the cost/benefit of adding the resulting carbon dioxide, other gases and particulates to air in the region of the desalination plant?

- impacts of managing and disposing of the chemical byproducts and solid waste produced by constructing and operating the plant,

What are the chemicals that would be used in all phases of water treatment—in particular maintaining the membranes—and chemical waste produced for the proposed plant? What is the safety data on these materials? What impact will their transport and disposal have? What is the cost/benefit of introducing these and disposing these in the region in comparison to conservation of water?

- outside limits of water that could be drawn from the Hudson without ecological damage to the estuary,

It has been suggested that desalination would mean an endless supply of water unaffected by climate change. Obviously the Hudson River is connected to all the water in all the world's oceans, but at what point would changes in Haverstraw Bay, affects on the air and soil, and the power needed be too great to bear, – in the case that it is found to be tenable at least minimally? What is the cost/benefit of introducing these and disposing these in the region in comparison to conservation of water?

- methane production from decay of biota in the Hudson River as a result of water withdrawals.

What would be the projected production of additional methane? What would be the consequences of this production to the local climate? To global climate change? What is the cost/benefit of introducing these and disposing these in the region in comparison to conservation of water?

Sincerely,

Patsy Wooters, Chair TVPA  
Home: 845.357.9249  
Cell: 845.304.9688  
Email: [patsy.wooters@gmail.com](mailto:patsy.wooters@gmail.com)